

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION
RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,
SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in
Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Naresh Kumar
Section Officer, # 2190,
Sector 44-C, Chandigarh 160047.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,
O/o Punjab State Board of Technical
Education & Industrail Training,
Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Secretary, Punjab State Board of Technical
Education & Industrail Training,
Chandigarh

.....Respondent

APPEAL CASE NO. : 4244/2022

Present:

Appellant: Shri Naresh Kumar

Respondent: Dr. Jagdeep Kaur, (Deputy Director, Academics)

Order (3rd Hearing) :

1. The above mentioned Appeal Case is fixed for hearing before the Bench of Hon'ble State Information Commissioner, Punjab Shri Anumit Singh Sodhi. The Registry Branch vide his office order no. PSIC/Legal/2024/480, dated 04.09.2024 has re-allocated the above mentioned cases to the undersigned bench. Accordingly the case are fixed for hearing today.

2. Both parties were present for the hearing today. The Commission **is not satisfied** with the reply (letter ref. no. 610 Dated 22.02.223) of the respondent PIO and **directs the PIO to provide an appropriate response on or before the next date of hearing.**

3. In this case, the **appellant is an employee of the same department** and has raised concerns regarding **partiality or possible corruption** within the department. As per **Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act, 2005**, public authorities are required to **disclose administrative details**, including **transfers, deputations, and postings of employees**. Additionally, **Supreme Court and CIC rulings** affirm that **service records, deputation details, and tenure of government employees do not qualify as personal information and can be disclosed unless they affect national security or personal safety**. *For instance, in the case of Mr. Sudershan Singh vs. NDMC (Decision No. CIC/SG/A/2009/003165/6825, dated 15 February 2010), the CIC held that while personal files may contain information exempt under Section 8(1)(j) of the RTI Act, service records are generated in a public activity and their disclosure cannot be considered an invasion of privacy.*

4. Considering the **allegations of bias or corruption**, the **PIO is directed to provide an appropriate and complete response as per the Commission's previous directions, on or before the next date of hearing, without fail.**

5. Next hearing on 05.03.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh
29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Naresh Kumar

Section Officer, # 2190,
Sector 44-C, Chandigarh
160047.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,

O/o Principal Secretary, Punjab State
Board of Technical Education
& Industrial Training, Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,

O/o Principal Secretary, Punjab State
Board of Technical Education
& Industrial Training, Chandigarh

.....Respondent

APPEAL CASE NO. : 2665/2023

Present:

Appellant: Shri Naresh Kumar

Respondent: Dr. Jagdeep Kaur, (Deputy Director, Academics)

Order (1st Hearing) :

1. The above mentioned Appeal Case is fixed for hearing before the Bench of Hon'ble State Information Commissioner, Punjab Shri Anumit Singh Sodhi. The Registry Branch vide his office order no. PSIC/Legal/2024/480, dated 04.09.2024 has re-allocated the above mentioned cases to the undersigned bench. Accordingly the case are fixed for hearing today.

2. Both parties were present for the hearing today. The Commission **is not satisfied** with the reply (letter ref. no. 2115 Dated 05.07.2023) of the respondent PIO and **directs the PIO to provide an appropriate response on or before the next date of hearing.**

3. **Next hearing on 05.03.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh**

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION
RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,
SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in
Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Sarabjit Singh,
S/o Sh. Jagir Singh, # 298, Sector 15,
Adarsh Colony, Sarna,
Tehsil & Distt Pathankot- 145025.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,
O/o Director, Technical Education
& Industrail Training Department, Pb.
Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Director, Technical Education
& Industrail Training Department, Pb.
Chandigarh.

.....Respondent

APPEAL CASE NO. : 5777/2022

Present:

Appellant: Shri Sarabjit Singh

Respondent: Sh. Subhash Chandar (Principal), Sh. Baljit singh (Training Officer), Sh. Manga Singh (Asst. Director), Vikramjeet Singh(clerk)

Order (3rd Hearing) :

1. The above mentioned Appeal Case is fixed for hearing before the Bench of Hon'ble State Information Commissioner, Punjab Shri Anumit Singh Sodhi. The Registry Branch vide his office order no. PSIC/Legal/2024/480, dated 04.09.2024 has re-allocated the above mentioned cases to the undersigned bench. Accordingly the case are fixed for hearing today.
2. Both parties are present. The respondent Public Information Officer (PIO) submitted a reply to the show-cause notice issued on 20.09.2023, along with a response/information available in the office records. The same was handed over to the appellant during the hearing vide letter ref. no. 282 dated 28.01.2025, with a copy furnished to the Commission.
3. The appellant contended that the reply provided is misleading and incomplete. The respondent PIO, in turn, stated that the appellant himself was the custodian of the records when he was in service, which he is now seeking from the department. The appellant clarified that he retired in 2020 and has been receiving a regular pension from the government, implying that all necessary records must have been submitted at the time of retirement. He further alleged that he is being harassed by the department.

Contd. Pg. No. 2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



APPEAL CASE NO. : 5777/2022

4. After hearing both parties and reviewing the case file, the following directions are issued:

a. The appellant shall submit, in writing, the specific discrepancies in the information provided by the respondent within **10 days** from the date of this order, under intimation to the Commission.

b. The respondent PIO shall address any deficiencies pointed out by the appellant within the stipulated period.

c. If any portion of the requested information is unavailable in the office records, the respondent PIO shall furnish an affidavit duly notary attested to the appellant, with a copy to the Commission, confirming the non-availability of such records.

5. A compliance report must be submitted in the Commission on or before the next date of hearing. The matter shall be reviewed after compliance with the above directions. Failure to comply may attract appropriate action under the relevant provisions of the RTI Act, 2005.

6. Next hearing on 05.03.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Sarabjit Singh,

S/o Sh. Jagir Singh, # 298, Sector 15,

Adarsh Colony, Sarna,

Tehsil & Distt Pathankot- 145025.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,

O/o Director, Technical Education

& Industrail Training Department, Pb.

Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,

O/o Director, Technical Education

& Industrail Training Department, Pb.

Chandigarh.

.....Respondent

APPEAL CASE NO. : 5778/2022

Present:

Appellant: Shri Sarabjit Singh

Respondent: Sh. Subhash Chandar (Principal), Sh. Baljit singh (Training Officer), Sh.

Manga Singh (Asst. Director), Vikramjeet Singh(clerk)

Order (3rd Hearing) :

1. The above mentioned Appeal Case is fixed for hearing before the Bench of Hon'ble State Information Commissioner, Punjab Shri Anumit Singh Sodhi. The Registry Branch vide his office order no. PSIC/Legal/2024/480, dated 04.09.2024 has re-allocated the above mentioned cases to the undersigned bench. Accordingly the case are fixed for hearing today.

2. Both parties are present. The respondent Public Information Officer (PIO) submitted a reply to the show-cause notice issued on 20.09.2023, along with a response/information available in the office records. The same was handed over to the appellant during the hearing vide letter ref. no. 286 dated 28.01.2025, with a copy furnished to the Commission.

3. The appellant contended that the reply provided is misleading and incomplete. After hearing both parties and reviewing the case file, the following directions are issued:

a) The appellant shall submit, in writing, the specific discrepancies in the information provided by the respondent within 10 days from the date of this order, under intimation to the Commission.

b) The respondent PIO shall address any deficiencies pointed out by the appellant within the stipulated period.

Contd. Pg. No. 2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



APPEAL CASE NO. : 5778/2022

c) If any portion of the requested information is unavailable in the office records, the respondent PIO shall furnish an affidavit duly notary attested to the appellant, with a copy to the Commission, confirming the non-availability of such records.

4. A compliance report must be submitted in the Commission on or before the next date of hearing. The matter shall be reviewed after compliance with the above directions. Failure to comply may attract appropriate action under the relevant provisions of the RTI Act, 2005.

5. Next hearing on 05.03.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION
RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,
SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in
Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Ms. Bhupinder Kaur, (99883 04612)
R/o Village Gharuan, Tehsil Kharar,
District S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,
O/o Nagar Panchayat,
Khara, District S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

NOW

Public Information Officer,
O/o Nagar Panchayat,
Gharuan, District S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Additional Deputy Commissioner,
Urban Development, S.A.S. Nagar.

...Respondents

APPEAL CASE NO. 4546 OF 2024

Date of RTI Application	Date of Reply, if any of PIO	Date of First Appeal made, if any	Date of Order, if any of FAA	Date of Appeal/ Complaint Filed in Commission
19.09.2023	-	15.06.2024	-	12.07.2024

Present:

Appellant: Ms. Bhupinder Kaur
Respondent: Sh. Gaurav (Accountant)

ORDER (1st Hearing):

1. The appellant has sought information pertaining to **the report submitted by the officials (mentioned in RTI application) against his complaint no. 1754 dated 15.05.2023.**

2. Both parties are present for the hearing today. The RTI application was initially sent to the **Public Information Officer, O/o Nagar Panchayat, Khara, District S.A.S Nagar (Mohali)**; however, it actually pertains to the **Public Information Officer, O/o Nagar Panchayat, Gharuan, District S.A.S Nagar (Mohali)**.

3. A copy of the notice along with the RTI application has been handed over to the respondent, **Sh. Gaurav (Accountant, O/o Nagar Panchayat, Gharuan)**, who is present today.

4. Accordingly, the respondent **PIO is strictly directed to be present with the requisite information on the next date of hearing without fail.** Failure to comply will result in the initiation of **penal action** against the PIO.

5. Next hearing on 10.02.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.
Chandigarh
29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Roshan Lal Singla, (83691 19715)

S/o Shri Sadhu Ram

R/o # E1901 Sai Mannat HCS,

Sector 34-A, Kharghar-4101210

Navi Mumbai.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,

O/o Director,

Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab,

Forest Complex, S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

First Appellate Authority,

O/o Director,

Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab,

Forest Complex, S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

....Respondents

APPEAL CASE NO. 6151& 6262 OF 2024

Date of RTI Application	Date of Reply, if any of PIO	Date of First Appeal made, if any	Date of Order, if any of FAA	Date of Appeal/ Complaint Filed in Commission
26.06.2024	-	26.09.2024	-	09.10.2024

Present:

Appellant: Adv. C.S. Pasricha (counsel for appellant)

Respondent: Sh. Mukesh Joshi (Senior Assistant)

ORDER (1st Hearing):

1. The information sought by the appellant pertains to the **action taken report** on **Letter No. SAI Pen O 1/R/89-90/23-24/4109 & dated 29.09.2023**, in both the above mentioned cases, which concerns the inclusion of the appellant's **widow daughter, Smt. Kanta Devi's name in the appellant's service book/service record.**

2. The respondent PIO, represented by **Sh. Mukesh Joshi (Senior Assistant)**, submitted that the matter of adding the appellant's (**Shri Roshan Lal Singla**) daughter's name to the service book has been considered. He presented a letter (**Ref. No. 2893 dated 05.04.2024**) from the **Superintendent Grade-1, O/o Director, Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab (RDE-1 Branch).**

3. On this, **Adv. C.S. Pasricha, representative of the appellant**, contended that the reply is **incomplete and unsatisfactory.** He stated that it should be **clearly mentioned that "Smt. Kanta Devi be recorded as a beneficiary for family pension in the service book of the appellant, Sh. Roshan Lal,"** and a copy of the updated service book with the entry be provided.

4. Furthermore, he emphasized that the appellant, **Shri Roshan Lal Singla, is around 95 years old and remains constantly worried about his daughter's future.** Given his advanced age, he requested the Commission to treat the matter **on an urgent basis** and ensure the necessary action is taken promptly.

Contd. Pg. No. 2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



APPEAL CASE NO. 6151& 6262 OF 2024

5. After considering all facts of the case and the appellant's **old age and concerns**, the Commission **directs the respondent PIO to provide a copy of the service book of the appellant after making a clear entry of Smt. Kanta Devi's name as a beneficiary for family pension within five (05) working days without fail.**

As both parties are common and the matter is similar, a **single interim order** is being passed for both the above-mentioned cases.

5. Next hearing on 10.02.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Shri Roshan Lal Singla, (83691 19715)

S/o Shri Sadhu Ram

R/o # E1901 Sai Mannat HCS,

Sector 34-A, Kharghar-4101210

Navi Mumbai.

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,

O/o Director,

Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab,

Forest Complex, S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

First Appellate Authority,

O/o Director,

Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab,

Forest Complex, S.A.S Nagar (Mohali).

....Respondents

APPEAL CASE NO. 6151& 6262 OF 2024

Date of RTI Application	Date of Reply, if any of PIO	Date of First Appeal made, if any	Date of Order, if any of FAA	Date of Appeal/ Complaint Filed in Commission
26.06.2024	-	26.09.2024	-	09.10.2024

Present:

Appellant: Adv. C.S. Pasricha (counsel for appellant)

Respondent: Sh. Mukesh Joshi (Senior Assistant)

ORDER (1st Hearing):

1. The information sought by the appellant pertains to the **action taken report** on **Letter No. SAI Pen O 1/R/89-90/23-24/4109 & dated 29.09.2023**, in both the above mentioned cases, which concerns the inclusion of the appellant's **widow daughter, Smt. Kanta Devi's name in the appellant's service book/service record.**

2. The respondent PIO, represented by **Sh. Mukesh Joshi (Senior Assistant)**, submitted that the matter of adding the appellant's (**Shri Roshan Lal Singla**) daughter's name to the service book has been considered. He presented a letter (**Ref. No. 2893 dated 05.04.2024**) from the **Superintendent Grade-1, O/o Director, Rural Development & Panchayat Department, Punjab (RDE-1 Branch).**

3. On this, **Adv. C.S. Pasricha, representative of the appellant**, contended that the reply is **incomplete and unsatisfactory.** He stated that it should be **clearly mentioned that "Smt. Kanta Devi be recorded as a beneficiary for family pension in the service book of the appellant, Sh. Roshan Lal,"** and a copy of the updated service book with the entry be provided.

4. Furthermore, he emphasized that the appellant, **Shri Roshan Lal Singla, is around 95 years old and remains constantly worried about his daughter's future.** Given his advanced age, he requested the Commission to treat the matter **on an urgent basis** and ensure the necessary action is taken promptly.

Contd. Pg. No. 2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



APPEAL CASE NO. 6151& 6262 OF 2024

5. After considering all facts of the case and the appellant's **old age and concerns**, the Commission **directs the respondent PIO to provide a copy of the service book of the appellant after making a clear entry of Smt. Kanta Devi's name as a beneficiary for family pension within five (05) working days without fail.**

As both parties are common and the matter is similar, a **single interim order** is being passed for both the above-mentioned cases.

5. Next hearing on 10.02.2025 at 11.00 AM at Punjab State Information Commission, Red Cross Building, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh.

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)

State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh

29.01.2025

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION
RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,
SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in
Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Advocate Manjit Singh Komal, (99145 14555)
R/o 174-A, Shastri Nagar,
Model Town, Ludhiana-141002

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,
O/o Deputy Commissioner,
Ludhiana.

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Deputy Commissioner,
Ludhiana.

....Respondents

APPEAL CASE NO. 6747 OF 2023

Date of RTI Application	Date of Reply, if any of PIO	Date of First Appeal made, if any	Date of Order, if any of FAA	Date of Appeal/ Complaint Filed in Commission
07.07.2023	-	21.08.2023	-	16.10.2023

Present:

Appellant: Advocate Manjit Singh Komal
Respondent: Absent

ORDER (1st Hearing):

1. The appellant has filed an appeal case before the Commission under **Section 19 of the RTI Act**. Accordingly, the case is **fixed for hearing today**.
2. The appellant is present today and has stated that no information has been provided to him so far by the PIO. As **no representative from the respondent authority is present**, the case is **adjourned to 03.03.2025 at 11:00 AM via Cisco Webex**.
3. The **respondent PIO is directed to file a reply/supply the required information before the next date of hearing**. Failure to comply will result in action under **Section 20(1) of the RTI Act**.

{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 25144379944 Pswd: 12345 }

(Sandeep Singh Dhaliwal)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.
Chandigarh
29.01.2025