Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Yogesh Malhotra, Advocate S/o Sh. H. L. Malhotra, 14, Shastri Market, Jalandhar(Punjab) (M.-9815963798)

.....Appellant

Public Information Officer,

 i) Public Information Officer O/o The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Jalandhar(Punjab)

ii) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Commissioner,
Municipal Corporation,

Encl : RTI request Phagwara(Punjab)

First Appellate Authority O/o The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Jalandhar(Punjab)

.....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 2601 of 2020

Present: None on behalf of the appellant.

Sh. Avtar Chand(M.-9988463263), Bill Clerk, on behalf of the respondent.

Vs

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 25.09.2024. The case was fixed for 13.11.2024 but due to administrative reasons, the case could not be heard and further fixed for hearing today i. e. 28.11.2024.

2. The respondent O/o the M. C., Jalandhar made the submissions that Sh. Ashwani Kumar, L. A. has already been shifted to M. C., Phagwara and the original record related to him has already been sent to the said office. Since, the appellant is seeking the information related to Sh. Ashwani Kumar, L. A., who has been posted in the O/o M. C., Phagwara, therefore, a copy of this order is **being sent** to PIO concerned aongwith RTI application with the directions to file a point wise reply in an annotated form. It is also a fact that PIO O/o M. C., Phagwara was impleaded as necessary party but neither he is appearing nor any submissions have been received from him. Therefore, a copy of this order is **being sent** to the Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Phagwara to procure the presence of the concerned PIO on the next date of hearing, failing which he will be directed for personal appearance in this case as the RTI application of the appellant is dated 29.08.2020.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in





Appeal Case No. 2601 of 2020

-2-

- 3. It is also clarified that in case of defiance of this order, the presence of the concerned Public Information Officer will be procured by issuing **BAILABLE WARRANTS** and/or disciplinary action may be recommended in this case to the competent authority.
- 4. Last opportunity is also given to the appellant to remain present on the next date of hearing, failing which the case will be decided on merit, ex-parte.
- With this, the case is adjourned to 22nd January, 2025 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing at 5. Chandigarh.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh) **Chief Information Commissioner** Punjab

CC:

The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Phagwara (Punjab)

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Balbir Aggarwal, 1525/1, Street – 33, Preet Nagar, Shimplauri, Ludhiana(Punjab)

.....Appellant

Vs

Public Information Officer, O/o The Chief Sanitary Officer, Municipal Corportion, Zone – C, Ludhiana (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority
O/o The Chief Sanitary Officer,
Municipal Corportion,
Zone – C, Ludhiana (Punjab)

.....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 534 of 2023

Present: None on behalf of the appellant.

None on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 23.10.2024.

- 2. The appellant is absent without intimation but he has sent the written submission to with regard to imposition of penalty. It is also a fact that one last opportunity was awarded to the appellant to remain present but he has not pointed out any deficiency in the information so supplied by the respondent.
- 3. After going though the submissions made by the appellant, the case is **closed** to supply the information in this case. It is also a fact that a penalty amounting to Rs. 10000/- has already been imposed upon the PIO (Health Branch) and a letter bearing no. 2097/2C/J/B dated 14.10.2004 has also been received from the Assistant Commissioner-cum-BDO, Health Branch M.C., Ludhiana but a copy of challan has not been received in this regard. Accordingly, he is directed to submit a copy of challan before the next date of hearing, failing which he will be directed for personal appearance.

Contd...2/-

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Appeal Case No. 534 of 2023

-2-

- 4. It is also clarified that in case of defiance of this order, the presence of the concerned Public Information Officer will be procured by issuing **BAILABLE WARRANTS** and/or disciplinary action may be recommended in this case to the competent authority.
- 5. With this, the case is <u>adjourned to 9th January, 2025 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing at</u> Chandigarh.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

CC: The Assistant Commissioner-cum-BDO,

Health Branch,

O/o Municipal Corportion,

Ludhiana (Punjab)

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh.(Dr.) Sunil Khosla # 557 P, UGF, Celestia Royal, Omaxe New Chandigarh, Mullanpur, s.A.S. Nagar (Mohali) -140901(Punjab)

....Appellant

Public Information Officer, O/o The Principal Arya College, Rishi Dayanand Marg, Civil Lines, Ludhiana(Punjab)

First Appellate Authority O/o The Principal Arya College, Rishi Dayanand Marg, Civil Lines, Ludhiana (Punjab)

.....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 5415 of 2023

Present: None on behalf of the appellant.

Sh. Parveen Mayar(M.-9878122911)Superintendent-cum-PIO, in person.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 25.09.2024. The case was fixed for 13.11.2024 but due to administrative reasons, the case could not be heard and further fixed for hearing today i. e. 28.11.2024.

Vs

- 2. The appellant is absent. The respondent submitted that the sought information is regarding joining of Dr.(Mrs.) Sarita Behl, which is 'third party' information and a letter was sent to get the consent of the 'third party' but till date no response has been received from her. It is also a fact that 'third party' was also impleaded as necessary party in this case as per the Punjab RTI Rules, 2017 and a copy of the order dated 24.07.2024 was sent to her through registered post to file the submissions that why the information related to her may not be supplied to the appellant. But till date no submissions has been received from her. It prima facie seems that she has no objection, if information would be supplied to the appellant.
- 3. After detailed deliberation with the respondent, he is directed to supply the information to the appellant within fifteen days.
- **Last opportunity** is also given to the appellant to remain present on the next date of hearing, failing which the case will be decided on merit, ex-parte.
- 5. With this, the case is <u>adjourned to 18th December, 2024 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing</u> at Chandigarh.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100

Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Rajiv Singla S/o Sh. Pawan Kumar Singla, # 341, Ward No 9, Master Colony, Peer Banna Banoai Road, Sunam-148028(Punjab) (M: 9216813000)

.....Appellant

- i) Public Information Officer,
 O/o The Block Primary Education Officer,
 Boys School, Sunam 148028,
 Distt Sangrur(Punjab)
- ii) Public Information Officer,
 O/o The International Oxford School,
 Day Care, Pre-Schooling to 5th
 City Road to Cinema Road,
 Sunam-148028
 District Sangrur(Punjab)

First Appellate Authority
O/o The Block Primary Education Officer,
Boys School, Sunam – 148028,
Distt Sangrur(Punjab)

..... Respondents

Appeal Case No. 5569 of 2023

Present: Sh. Rajiv Singla, the appellant in person.

Sh. Abhinav Jaidka(M.-9855077877), B. P. E. O., Sunam in person.

Vs

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 11.09.2024. Through that order the PIO O/o International Oxford School, Day Care, Pre-Schooling to 5th, Sunam was impleaded as a necessary party in this case to file reply/supply the information.

- 2. The appellant submitted that no informtion has been given to him by the respondent even after the directions were given vide orders dated 11.09.2024. None came appeared from International Oxford School, Day Care, Pre-Schooling to 5th, Sunam.
- 3. The respondent submits that the sought information as available in the record of B.P.E.O., Sunam, has already been supplied to the appelant and nothing more is available on record which could be supplied to the appellant. The respondent further clarified that all the papers reated to the affiliation/recognition of the said school may be available in the office of the District Education Officer(Elem.), Sangrur. As such a copy of this order is **being sent** to Ms. Baljinder Kaur, District Education Officer(Elem.), Sangrur with the directions to ensure presence

Contd...2/-

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Appeal Case No. 5569 of 2023

-2-

of the PIO O/o International Oxford School, Day Care, Pre-Schooling to 5th, Sunam on the next date of hearing otherwise stringent action would be taken whosoever at fault. She is at liberty to take any coersive measure to ensure the presence of the representative of the said school. She is also directed to submit action taken report on the next date of hearing.

- 4. The District Education Officer(Elem.), Sangrur is also directed to ensure the presence of the PIO alongwith the original record related to the RTI application, a copy of which is **being sent** to her alongwith this order. It is also clarified that in case no response has been received from the said school i. e . International Oxford School, Day Care, Pre-Schooling to 5th, Sunam the Commission will proceed as per the procedure established by law.
- 5. With this, the case is <u>adjourned to 22nd January, 2025 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing</u> <u>at Chandigarh</u>.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

CC: Ms. Baljinder Kaur,

District Education Officer(Elem.),

Encl : RTI application Sangrur

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Jagjiwan Singh S/o Sh. Tahil Singh Village Kalal Majra, District Barnala (Punjab) (M:9914257151)

.....Appellant

Public Information Officer, O/o The Block Development and Panchayat Officer, Block Mahal Kalan, District Barnala (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority
O/o The District Development
& Panchayat Officer,
Barnala (Punjab)

.....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 5483 of 2023

Present: Sh. Jagjiwan Singh, the appellant in person.

i) Sh. Kulwinder Singh(M.9417446803), Panchayat Secretary;

Vs

ii) Sh. Gurdeep Singh(M.7888662483) Panchayat Secretary, for respondent.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 04.09.2024. The case was fixed for 13.11.2024 but due to administrative reasons, the case could not be heard and further fixed for hearing today i. e. 28.11.2024.

- 2. The respondent submitted that the information as available on record has already been supplied to the appellant and a compensation as has been awarded in the case amounting to Rs. 5000/- has already been paid to the appellant vide DD No. 415798 dated 11.03.2024. A copy of the cheque submitted by the respondent is taken on record. The appellant submitted that he is not satisfied with the information so supplied by the respondent. Accordingly, the appellant is directed to send the deficiencies, if any, to the respondent PIO within fifteen days from today and the respondent is directed to remove the same before the next date of hearing.
- 3. It is also a fact that a show cause notice was issued to Sh. Darshan Singh on 04.09.2024 and according to the submissions received from B.D.P.O., Mahil Kalan, the show-cause notice issued to him is hereby withdrawn.
- 4. With this, the case is <u>adjourned to 29th January, 2025 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing</u> at Chandigarh.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Kuldip Kumar, H. No. 3261, Rattan Singh Chowk, F.G.C. Road, Amritsar - 143001(Punjab) (M.-7814348489)

.....Appellant

Public Information Officer, O/o The Environmental Engineer, Punjab Pollution Control Board, Amritsar (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority
O/o The Senior Environmental Engineer,
Punjab Pollution Control Board,
Amritsar (Punjab)

.....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 1308 of 2023

Present: Sh. Kuldip Kumar, the appellant attended the hearing through Video Conference.

Sh. Vinod Kumar, S.D.O. attended the hearing through Video Conference.

Vs

ORDER

Heard through Video Conference.

- 2. This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 25.09.2024. The case was fixed for 13.11.2024 and postponed for today i. e. 28.11.2024.
- 3. The respondent submitted that a point wise reply has already been given to the appellant on 28.10.2022 with a copy to the Commission. The appellant submitted that satisfactory reply has not been received from the respondent. As the respondent has filed reply at very initial stage i. e. 28.10.2022, accordingly, the respondent is directed to send a point wise reply in an annotated form to the appellant as well as to the Commission within fifteen days from today. The appellant is also advised to file deficiencies to the respondent in writing within one month to the respondent with a copy to the Commission.
- 4. With this, the case is <u>adjourned to 22nd January, 2025 at 11:30 A. M. for hearing</u> through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Amritsar.

Date 28th November, 2024

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Karandeep Singh, S/o Sh. Pipal Singh, R/o Village Rora Wali, Tehsil Malout, District Sri Mukatsar Sahib.

.....Appellant

Vs

Public Information Officer,
MNREGA, Block Lambi,
District Sri Mukatsar Sahib.
First Appellat Authority
O/o Block Development and Panchayat Officer,
Block Lambi, Distarict Sri Mukatsar Sahib.

.....Respondents

Complaint Case No. 107 of 2024 (Converted into Appeal Case)

Present: (i) Sh. Karandeep Singh, the appellant (in person).

(ii) Sh. Deepak Sharma, APO (9876652233), Sh. Chetan Singh, T.A (7973633757) and

Sh. Ashok Kumar, T.A (9988533008) on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 30.10.2024.

- 2. At today's hearing, the appellant is present in person and has made written submissions, which are taken on record.
- 3. Sh. Deepak Sharma, APO has filed a written submission, during the hearing. The relevant portion of the reply is appended below:-

ਉਪਰੋਕਤ ਵਿਸ਼ੇ ਦੇ ਸੰਬੰਧ ਵਿੱਚ ਬੇਨਤੀ ਹੈ ਕਿ ਅਪੀਲ ਕਰਤਾ ਸ਼੍ਰੀ ਕਿਰਨਦੀਪ ਸਿੰਘ ਵਾਸੀ ਰੋੜਾਵਾਲੀ ਵੱਲੋਂ RTI ਐਕਟ ਅਧੀਨ ਸੂਚਨਾ ਦੀ ਮੰਗ ਕੀਤੀ ਗਈ ਸੀ। ਜਿਸ ਸਬੰਧੀ ਅਪੀਲਕਰਤਾ ਨੂੰ ਮਿਤੀ 09/08/2024 ਰਾਹੀ ਰਜਿਸਟਰਡ Point No.4 ਨਾਲ ਸਬੰਧਤ 432 ਪੇਜ਼ (M.B) ਮੁਹਇਆ ਕਰਵਾ ਦਿੱਤੇ ਗਏ ਸਨ ਅਤੇ ਮਿਤੀ 30/10/2024 ਨੂੰ ਕਿਰਨਦੀਪ ਨੇ Point No. 1 ਤੋਂ 4 ਨਾਲ ਸਬੰਧਤ ਰਿਕਾਰਡ ਦੀਆਂ 1159 ਕਾਪੀਆਂ ਪ੍ਰਾਪਤ ਕਰ ਲਈਆਂ ਸਨ ਜਿਸ ਦੀ ਰਸੀਦ ਨਾਲ ਨੱਥੀ ਹੈ ਜੀ। ਪ੍ਰੰਤੂ ਅੱਜ ਮਿਤੀ 28/11/24 ਨੂੰ ਉਕਤ ਵਿਅਕਤੀ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਇਹ 1159 ਕਾਪੀਆਂ ਵਾਪਸ ਕਰ ਦਿੱਤੀਆਂ ਗਈਆਂ ਹਨ। ਪੇਜ਼ ਨੰਬਰ 1 ਤੋਂ 3 ਤੱਕ ਜ਼ੋ ਮਟੀਰਿਅਲ ਅਤੇ ਲੇਬਰ/ਮਿਸਤਰੀਆਂ ਦੀਆਂ ਵੇਜ਼ ਲਿਸਟਾਂ ਦੀ ਮੰਗ ਕੀਤੀ ਗਈ ਹੈ, ਜ਼ੋ ਕਿ 3rd Party ਨਾਲ ਸਬੰਧਤ ਹਨ। ਇਹਨਾਂ ਵਿੱਚ ਲਾਭਪਾਤਰੀਆਂ/ਫਰਮਾਂ ਦੇ ਨਿੱਜੀ ਖਾਤਿਆਂ ਦੀ ਜਾਣਕਾਰੀ ਹੈ ਜ਼ੋ ਕਿ ਨਹੀਂ ਦਿੱਤੀ ਜਾ ਸਕਦੀ। ਮੈਂ ਆਪ ਜੀ ਨੂੰ ਬੇਨਤੀ ਕਰਦਾ ਹਾਂ ਕਿ ਉਕਤ ਰਿਕਾਰਡ ਦੀਆਂ 1159 ਕਾਪੀਆਂ ਆਪ ਜੀ ਦੇ ਦਫਤਰ ਜਮਾਂ ਕੀਤੀਆਂ ਜਾਣਦੀਆਂ ਹਨ ਅਤੇ ਸ਼ਿਕਾਇਤ ਦਫਤਰ ਦਾਖਲ ਕੀਤੀ ਜਾਵੇ ਜੀ।

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Complaint Case No. 107 of 2024 (Converted into Appeal Case)

- 4. Further, the appellant submitted that the respondent are supplying the certified information which is available on the website i.e. www.MGNREGA.com, whereas he has sought the same which is in the physical possession of the respondent, from where the information is being uploaded on their official website. He has also submitted a specimen, copy of the same which is taken on record. But the appellant while filling the RTI application dated 14.08.2023, has nowhere clarified the said fact.
- 5. In the interest of natural justice <u>final opportunity</u> is granted to both the parties to make their final written submissions, if any, to take the matter to its logical end. The Order is '<u>Reserved'</u> and will be pronounced in due course of time. Copies of the order be sent to the parties.

Sd/-(Inderpal Singh) Chief Information Commissioner Puniab

R.S

Dated: 28th November, 2024

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Karandeep Singh, S/o Sh. Pipal Singh, R/o Village Rora Wali, Tehsil Malout, District Sri Mukatsar Sahib.

.....Appellant

Vs

Public Information Officer,

O/o Block Development and Panchayat Officer, District Sri Mukatsar Sahib.

First Appellat Authority

O/o Disrict Development and Panchayat Officer, Sri Mukatsar Sahib.

.....Respondents

Complaint Case No. 130 of 2024 (Converted into Appeal Case)

Present: (i) Sh. Karandeep Singh, the appellant (in person).

(ii) Sh. Kewal Kumar, BDPO (8146669111) along with Sh. Sukhdev Singh, APO

(9878769702) the respondent.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 30.10.2024.

- 2. At today's hearing, the appellant is present in person and has made written submissions, which are taken on record.
- 3. Sh. Kewal Kumar, BDPO is present in person and states that he has brought the information comprising 1493 pages, to deliver it personally to the appellant, today in the Commission. He further adds that the appellant has refused to accept the same. Also, the information pertaining to point No.2, the appellant has asked the copy of wage list of 830 beneficiaries, including their Account Numbers, Bank details and IFSC Codes and the respondent made the written submission that the same is being third party information, cannot be provided to him. Copy of the information is taken on record.
- 4. Further, the appellant submitted that the respondent are supplying the certified information which is available on the website i.e. www.MGNREGA.com, whereas he has sought the same which is in the physical possession of the respondent, from where the information is being uploaded on their official website. He has also submitted a specimen, copy of the same which is taken on record. But the appellant while filling the RTI application dated 24.07.2023, has nowhere clarified the said fact.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline No. 0172-2864100 Email: - pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com



Complaint Case No. 130 of 2024 (Converted into Appeal Case)

5. In the interest of natural justice <u>final opportunity</u> is granted to both the parties to make their final written submissions, if any, to take the matter to its logical end. The Order is '<u>Reserved'</u> and will be pronounced in due course of time. Copies of the order be sent to the parties.

Sd/(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner
Punjab

Dated: 28th November, 2024

R.S